

Agenda Date: 2/10/17 Agenda Item: 2A

STATE OF NEW JERSEY

Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 3rd Floor, Suite 314 Post Office Box 350 Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0350 www.nj.gov/bpu/

		ENERGY
IN THE MATTER OF THE PROVISION OF BASIC GENERATION SERVICE FOR THE PERIOD)).	DECISION AND ORDER
BEGINNING JUNE 1, 2017)	DOCKET NO. ER16040337

Parties of Record:

Gregory Eisenstark, Esq., Windels Marx Lane & Mittendorf, LLP, on behalf of Jersey Central Power & Light Company
Hesser McBride, Esq., Attorney for Public Service Electric and Gas Company
Philip J. Passanante, Esq., Associate General Counsel for Atlantic City Electric Company
Margaret Comes, Esq., Senior Attorney for Rockland Electric Company
Chantale LaCasse, BGS Auction Manager, NERA Economic Consulting
Stefanie A. Brand, Esq., Director, New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel
Holly Reed, Gabel Associates, on behalf of IEPNJ

BY THE BOARD:

By Order dated October 31, 2016 in this docket, the New Jersey Board of Public Utilities ("Board") approved the joint Basic Generation Service ("BGS") proposal of Public Service Electric and Gas Company ("PSE&G"), Jersey Central Power & Light Company ("JCP&L"), Atlantic City Electric Company ("ACE") and Rockland Electric Company ("Rockland") (collectively the "EDCs"), for two descending clock auctions to secure the EDCs' BGS electricity requirements for the period beginning June 1, 2017 ("October 31, 2016 Order"). In an attempt to mitigate the risk to ratepayers, the Board directed the EDCs to procure approximately one-third of the EDCs' BGS residential small commercial customers ("BGS-RSCP") load for a 36-month period through a single clearing price for each EDC's BGS supply requirements in the auction. The Board also found that a 12-month procurement period for the EDCs' hourly load BGS commercial and industrial energy pricing customers ("BGS-CIEP") is appropriate and reasonable. In the October 31, 2016 Order, the Board also committed to review the results of the BGS-RSCP Auction and the BGS-CIEP Auction (collectively the "BGS Auctions" or "Auctions") each in its entirety and certify the results of each auction for all of the EDCs, or for none of them, no later than the second business day after the last Auction closes.

¹ Approximately two-thirds of the EDCs' BGS-FP requirements are already under contract through May 31, 2018, and one-third through May 31, 2019 as a result of the 2015 and 2016 BGS-RSCP Auctions.

The results of the BGS Auctions, when approved by the Board, will then be converted into revised BGS rates for customers beginning June 1, 2017. This is the sixteenth year the Board has authorized a similar auction process to secure BGS supply.

The Auction Manager responsible for conducting the 2017 Auctions was National Economic Research Associates ("NERA"). NERA brings expertise in the conduct of simultaneous descending clock auctions in the energy and telecommunications industries, and has been the Auction Manager for the sixteen BGS Auctions. The 2017 Auctions were continuously monitored by Board Staff from the Division of Energy, as well as by the Board's consultant, Bates White, LLC² ("Bates White"). Bates White was retained to assist the Board in this process. Bates White has experience with simultaneous descending clock auctions and energy industry experience.

BGS-RSCP AUCTION SUMMARY

The BGS-RSCP Auction began on February 6, 2017 and ended on February 7, 2017 after 19 rounds with all of the EDCs' 53 tranches³ secured, with the following closing prices for each EDC:

EDC	Closing Price <u>¢/Kwh</u>	Total Tranches <u>Secured</u>
ACE	7.549	8
JCP&L	6.908	15
PSE&G	9.078	28
Rockland	8.050	2

A list of the BGS-RSCP Auction winners is included in Attachment A to this Order.

BGS-CIEP AUCTION SUMMARY

The BGS-CIEP Auction began on February 3, 2017, and ended on February 6, 2017 after 25 rounds with all of the EDCs' 43 tranches⁴ secured, with the following closing prices for each EDC:

EDC	Closing Price <u>\$/Mw-day</u>	Total Tranches <u>Secured</u>
ACE	217.00	5
JCP&L	218.00	12
PSE&G	276.83	25
Rockland	223.61	1

A list of the BGS-CIEP Auction winners is included in Attachment A to this Order.

² The original contract for consulting services was entered into by the Board in 2013 with Boston Pacific, LLC ("Boston Pacific"). In November 2016, Boston Pacific was acquired by Bates White.

³ A tranche in the BGS-RSCP Auction is approximately 100 Mw.

⁴ A tranche in the BGS-CIEP Auction is equivalent to approximately 75 Mw.

BGS AUCTION OVERSIGHT

NERA has provided a confidential post-Auction checklist form evaluating how the BGS-RSCP and BGS-CIEP Auctions were conducted. NERA's analysis supporting acceptance of the Auction results indicates, in part, that:

- no issues or questions were left unresolved prior to the Auctions that created uncertainty for bidders;
- neither procedural problems nor errors were observed during the Auctions; all communication protocols were followed;
- neither hardware nor software problems with the Auctions and communication systems were observed;
- no security breaches were observed during the Auction process;
- all guidelines for setting or changing the Auction parameters were followed;
- there was no evidence of confusion or misunderstanding on the part of bidders that delayed or impaired the Auctions in a material manner;
- communications between the Auction Manager and bidders was timely and effective;
- there was no evidence that bidders were rushed:
- no complaints were received from the bidders;
- the Auctions were carried out in a fair and transparent manner;
- there was no evidence of collusion or gaming by the bidders;
- public and sensitive information were treated appropriately;
- there were no factors exogenous to the Auctions that materially affected the Auctions;
 and
- the Auctions appear to have generated a result that is consistent with competitive bidding, market-determined prices, and efficient allocation of the BGS-RSCP and BGS-CIEP loads.

Bates White has also provided the Board with a confidential post-Auction evaluation form for the BGS-RSCP and BGS-CIEP Auctions, as well as a supplemental checklist reviewing how the Auctions were conducted. Bates White's analysis is consistent with NERA's analysis. Both consultants recommend that the Board accept the final Auction results.

BGS AUCTION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

The independent NERA and Bates White analyses are consistent with each other and indicate that the Auctions proceeded without meaningful interruption, according to the Board-approved Auction Rules, in an acceptably fair and transparent manner, and they both recommend that the Board certify the Auction results. Staff assigned to oversee the Auctions has also briefed the Board on the conduct and results of each Auction.

After reviewing the checklists and evaluation forms from NERA and Bates White, and discussing the results and conduct of the Auctions with Staff, NERA and Bates White, the Board **FINDS** that:

- all bidders had sufficient information to prepare for the Auctions;
- information was generally provided to bidders in accordance with the published timetable, and the timetable was adjusted appropriately as needed;
- there were no Auction issues or questions left unresolved prior to the Auctions that created material uncertainty for bidders;
- from what could be observed, there were neither procedural problems nor errors with the Auctions, including the electronic bidding process, the back-up bidding process, and communications between bidders and the Auction Manager;
- from what could be observed, communication protocols between bidders and the Auction Manager were adhered to;
- appropriate data back-up procedures were planned and carried out;
- no security breaches were observed during the Auction process;
- from what could be observed, communication protocols among the EDCs, NERA, Staff, the Board, and Bates White were followed during the Auctions;
- protocols were followed for decisions regarding changes in the Auction parameters (e.g. volume, load cap, bid decrements);
- the calculations (e.g. for bid decrements or bidder eligibility) produced by the Auction software were double-checked or reproduced off-line by the Auction Manager;
- there was no evidence of confusion or misunderstanding on the part of bidders that delayed or impaired the Auctions;
- from what could be observed, the communications between the Auction Manager and bidders was timely and effective;
- there were no complaints received from the bidders about the process;
- the Auctions were carried out in an acceptably fair and transparent manner;
- there was no evidence of gaming on the part of bidders;
- there was no evidence of collusion among bidders;
- information was made public in an appropriate manner and, from what could be observed, sensitive information was treated appropriately;
- there were no factors exogenous to the Auctions (e.g., changes in market environment) that materially affected the Auctions in unanticipated ways);
- there are no concerns with the Auctions' outcome with regard to any specific EDC(s);
- the Auctions appear to have generated a result that is consistent with competitive bidding, market-determined prices, and efficient allocation of the BGS-RSCP and BGS-CIEP loads.

Based on the foregoing, the Board <u>HEREBY CERTIFIES</u> the final results of the BGS-RSCP and BGS-CIEP Auctions in their entirety, and subsequently <u>APPROVES</u> the closing prices for each EDC. Furthermore, the Board <u>HEREBY ORDERS</u> the EDCs: 1) to execute the necessary documents with the winning bidders, including the BGS Supplier Master Agreements; 2) to implement the BGS rates resulting from the Auctions beginning June 1, 2017; and 3) to file tariff sheets reflecting those rates by March 24, 2017.

Consistent with past Board practice, the Board is releasing the names of the winning bidders at this time. However, at this time, the Board will not release the specific tranche and service area details for each successful bidder, so as not to compromise the position of the winning bidders in the marketplace. The Board plans to make this additional information public prior to June 1, 2017.

DATED: Feb. 10, 2017

BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES

RICHARD S. MRO PRESIDENT

JOSEPH L. FIORDALISO COMMISSIONER

MARY-ANNA HOLDEN COMMISSIONER

Yay-Asia Holden

DIANNE SOLOMON COMMISSIONER UPENDRA J. CHIVUKULA COMMISSIONER

ATTEST:

CYNTHIA E. COVIE ACTING SECRETARY

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the within document is a true copy of the original in the files of the Board of Public Utilities

ATTACHMENT A

I/M/O the Provision of Basic Generation Service For The Period Beginning June 1, 2017 Docket No. ER16040337

Auction Winners Approved by the Board of Public Utilities on February 10, 2017

BGS-RSCP Auction Winners

BP Energy Company
Calpine Energy Services LP
DTE Energy Trading, Inc.
Exelon Generation Company, LLC
Engelhart Commodities Trading Partners⁵
Macquarie Energy LLC
NextEra Energy Marketing, LLC⁶
Noble Americas Gas & Power Corp.
PSEG Energy Resources & Trade LLC
TransCanada Power Marketing Ltd.

BGS-CIEP Auction Winners

ConocoPhillips Company
DTE Energy Trading, Inc.
Engelhart Commodities Trading Partners
Exelon Generation Company, LLC
NextEra Energy Power Marketing, LLC
PSEG Energy Resources & Trade LLC

⁶ Formerly NextEra Energy Power Marketing, LLC

⁵ The company was formerly known as BTG Pactual Commodities S.A.

In the Matter of the Provision of Basic Generation Service For the Period Beginning June 1, 2017

Docket No. ER16040337 Service List

BPU

Irene Kim Asbury, Secretary
New Jersey Board of Public Utilities
Post Office Box 350
44 South Clinton Ave., 3rd Floor
Trenton, NJ 08625-0350
Irene.Asbury@bpu.nj.gov

Richard DeRose New Jersey Board of Public Utilities Post Office Box 350 44 South Clinton Ave., 3rd Floor Trenton, NJ 08625-0350 Richard.DeRose@bpu.nj.gov

Jerome May, Director New Jersey Board of Public Utilities Post Office Box 350 44 South Clinton Ave., 3rd Floor Trenton, NJ 08625-0350 Jerome.may@bpu.nj.gov

Mark Beyer, Chief Economist New Jersey Board of Public Utilities Post Office Box 350 44 South Clinton Ave., 3rd Floor Trenton, NJ 08625-0350 mark.beyer@bpu.nj.gov

Bethany Rocque-Romaine, Esq. New Jersey Board of Public Utilities Post Office Box 350 44 South Clinton Ave., 3rd Floor Trenton, NJ 08625-0350 Bethany.Romaine@bpu.nj.gov

Stacy Peterson New Jersey Board of Public Utilities Post Office Box 350 44 South Clinton Ave., 3rd Floor Trenton, NJ 08625-0350 stacy.peterson@bpu.nj.gov

DAG

Andrew Kuntz, Esq.
Deputy Attorney General
Division of Law
Board of Public Utilities Section
124 Halsey Street
P.O. Box 45029
Newark, New Jersey 07101
Andrew kuntz@lps.state.ni.us

BPU's BGS CONSULTANTS

Craig R. Roach Boston Pacific Company, Inc. 1100 New York Avenue, NW Suite 490 east Washington, DC 2005 croach@bostonpacific.com Frank Mossburg
Boston Pacific Company, Inc.
1100 New York Avenue, NW
Suite 490 east
Washington, DC 2005
finossburg@bostonpacific.com

DIVISION OF RATE COUNSEL

Stefanie A. Brand, Esq., Director Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4th Floor Post Office Box 003 Trenton, New Jersey 08625 sbrand@rpa.state.nj.us

Ami Morita Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4th Floor Post Office Box 003 Trenton, New Jersey 08625 amorita@rpa.state.nj.us

Diane Schulze
Division of Rate Counsel
140 East Front Street, 4th Floor
Post Office Box 003
Trenton, New Jersey 08625
dschulze@rpa.state.nj.us

PSE&G

Alexander C. Stern, Esq.
Assistant General Regulatory Counsel
Law Department
80 Park Plaza, T-05
Newark, New Jersey 07102-4194
Alexander.Stern@pseg.com

Terrence J. Moran
Public Service Electric & Gas Co.
80 Park Plaza, T-13
Newark, NJ 07101
Terrence.Moran@pseg.com

ATLANTIC CITY ELECTRIC CO.

Joseph F. Janocha, Manager, Regulatory Affairs Atlantic City Electric Co. – 63ML38 5100 Harding Highway Atlantic Regional Office Mays Landing, NJ 08330 joseph.janocha@pepcoholdings.com

Daniel A. Tudor Pepco Holdings, Inc. 701 Ninth Street NW Washington, DC 20068-0001 datudor@pepco.com

Philip J. Passanante,
Assistant General Counsel
Atlantic City Electric Co. - 89KS42
800 King Street, 5th Floor
PO Box 231
Wilmington, DE 19899-0231
philip.passanante@pepcoholdings.com

JCP&L

Kevin Connelly First Energy 300 Madison Avenue Morristown, NJ 07960 kconnelly@firstenergycorp.com

Greg Eisenstark Windels Marx &Mittendorf, LLP 120 Albany Street, 6th Floor New Brunswick, NJ 08901 geisenstark@windelsmarx.com

Sally J Cheong First Energy 300 Madison Avenue P. O. Box 1911 Morristown, NJ 07962-1911 scheong@firstenergycorp.com

ROCKLAND

John L. Carley, Esq.
Consolidated Edison Co. of NY
Law Dept., Room 1815-S
4 Irving Place
New York, NY 10003
carleyi@coned.com

James C. Meyer, Esq.
Riker, Danzig, Scherer, Hyland & Perretti
Headquarters Plaza
One Speedwell Avenue
Morristown, NJ 07962
jmeyer@riker.com

William A. Atzl, Jr.
Rockland Electric Company
4 Irving Place - 2nd Floor SE
New York, NY 10003
atzlw@coned.com

Margaret Comes, Esq., Consolidated Edison Co. of NY Law Department, Room 1815-S 4 Irving Place New York, NY 10003 comesm@coned.com

NERA

Gene Meehan NERA Economic Consulting 1255 23rd St. NW Washington, DC 20037 Gene.Meehan@NERA.com

Chantale LaCasse
NERA Economic Consulting
1255 23rd St. NW
Washington, DC 20037
Chantale.LaCasse@NERA.com

In the Matter of the Provision of Basic Generation Service For the Period Beginning June 1, 2017

Docket No. ER16040337 Service List

THIRD PARTY SUPPLIERS

Murray E. Bevin, Esq.
Bevan, Mosca, Giuditta & Zarillo, P.C.
776 Mountain Blvd.
Suite 202
Watchung, NJ 07069
mbevan@bmgzlaw.com

SueAnne I. Harrel Pepco Energy Services 39 Crestview Drive Asset Mgmt Group Clinton, NJ 08809 sharrel@pepcoenergy.com

Dana Swieson
EPEX
717 Constitution Drive
Suite 110
Exton, PA 19341
Dana.swieson@epex.cc

Marc A. Hanks Senior Manager, Government & Regulatory Affairs Direct Energy Services, LLC Marc.Hanks@directenergy.com

Mark S. Kumm Pepco Energy Services, Inc. 1300 N. 17th, Suite 1600 Arlington, VA 22209 mkumm@pepcoenergy.com

Stacey Rantala National Energy Marketers Association 3333 K Street, N.W., Suite 110 Washington, D.C. 20007 srantala@energymarketers.com

David B. Applebaum
Director, Regulatory Affairs
NextEra Energy Resources, LLC
21 Pardee Place
Ewing, New Jersey 08628
david.applebaum@nexteraenergy.com

David Gil Manager, Regulatory Affairs NextEra Energy Resources, LLC 700 Universe Boulevard Juno Beach, Florida 33408 david.gil@nexteraenergy.com

Kathleen Maher Constellation NewEnergy 810 Seventh Avenue, Suite 400 New York, NY 10019-5818 kathleen.maher@constellation.com Bob Blake
VP Elec. Operations & Regulatory
Affairs
MXenergy
10010 Junction Dr, Suite 104S
Annapolis Junction, MD 20701
rblake@mxenergy.com

NJLEUC

Paul F. Forshay, Partner SUTHERLAND 1275 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20004-2415 paul.forshay@sutherland.com

Steven S. Goldenberg, NJLEUC, Esq. Fox Rothschild LLP Princeton Corporate Center 997 Lenox Drive, BLDG. 3 Lawrenceville, NJ 08648-2311 SGoldenberg@foxrothschild.com

BGS SUPPLIERS

Steven Gabel - IEPNJ Gabel Associates 417 Denison Street Highland Park, NJ 08904 steven@gabelassociates.com

James Laskey, Esq. - IEPNJ Norris McLaughlin & Marcus 721 Route 202-206 Bridgewater, NJ 08807 jlaskey@nmmlaw.com

Mark Baird, Director, Regulatory Affairs RRI Energy, Inc. 7642 West 450 North Sharpsville, IN 46068 mbaird@rrienergy.com

Raymond Depillo
PSEG Energy Resources & Trade
80 Park Plaza, T-19
P.O. Box 570
Newark, NJ 07101
raymond.depillo@pseg.com

Shawn P. Leyden, Esq.
PSEG Energy Resources & Trade
80 Park Plaza, T-19
P. O. Box 570
Newark, NJ 07101
shawn.leyden@pseg.com

David K Richter, Esq. PSEG Regulatory Department 80 Park Plaza, T-5C P. O. Box 570 Newark, NJ 07101 david_richter@pseg.com

Ken Gfroerer RRI Energy RR1 Box 246 Stahlstown, PA 15687 kgfroerer@rrienergy.com

Craig S. Blume
Director, Power Marketing
UGI Energy Services / UGI
Development Company
One Meridian Boulevard, Suite 2C01
Wyomissing, PA 19610
cblume@ugies.com

Robert O'Connell, VP & Compliance Manager J.P. Morgan Ventures Energy Corp. 1033 Squires Drive West Chester, PA, 19382 robert.oconnell@jpmorgan.com

Deborah Hart, Vice President Morgan Stanley Capital Group 2000 Westchester Avenue Trading Floor Purchase, NY 10577 deborah.hart@morganstanley.com

Marcia Hissong, Director, Contract Administration/Counsel DTE EnergyTrading, Inc. 414 South Main Street Suite 200 Ann Arbor, MI 48104 hissongm@dteenergy.com

Don Hubschman American Electric Power 155 W. Nationwide Blvd. Columbus, OH 43215 dmhubschman@aepes.com

Christine McGarvey
AEP Energy Partners, Inc.
Energy Trader
155 W Nationwide Blvd
Suite 500
Columbus, OH 43215
clmcgarvey@aepes.com

In the Matter of the Provision of Basic Generation Service For the Period Beginning June 1, 2017

Docket No. ER16040337 Service List

Glenn Riepl
AEP Energy Services
1 Riverside Plaza
14th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-2373
gfriepl@aep.com

Jean-Paul St. Germain
Sempra Energy Trading
58 Commerce Road
Stamford, CT 06902
jean-paul.st.germain@rbssempra

Howard O. Thompson - BGS Russo Tumulty Nester Thompson Kelly, LLP 240 Cedar Knolls Road Suite 306 Cedar Knolls, NJ 07927 hthompson@russotumulty.com

Sharon Weber PPL Energy Plus 2 North 3rd Street TW 20 Allentown, PA 18101 siweber@pplweb.com

Stephen Wemple
Con Edison Energy
701 Westchester Avenue
Suite 201 West
White Plains, NY 10604
wemples@conedenergy.com

Glen Thomas
The P³ Group
GT Power Group LLC
1060 First Avenue
Suite 400
King of Prussia, PA 19406
Gthomas@gtpowergroup.com

Divesh Gupta
Senior Counsel
Constellation Energy
100 Constellation Way, Suite 500C
Baltimore, Maryland 21202
divesh.gupta@constellation.com

Tom Hoatson LS Power Development, LLC 2 Tower Center East Brunswick, NJ 08816 thoatson@lspower.com

John Citrolo Conectiv Energy Supply, Inc. PO Box 6066, MS 92DC69 Newark, DE 19714 john.citrolo@conectiv.com

Adam Kaufman
Executive Director
Independent Energy Producers of NJ
Five Vaughn Drive, Suite 101
Princeton, NJ 08540
akaufman@kzgrp.com

Stuart Ormsbee
TransCanada Power Marketing Ltd.
110 Tumpike Road, Suite 300
Westborough, MA 01581
Stuart ormsbee@transcanada.com

Gregory K. Lawrence Cadwalader, Wickersham & Taft LLP One World Financial Center New York, NY 10281 greg.lawrence@cwt.com

Victoria M. Lauterbach Cadwalader, Wickersham & Taft LLP 700 Sixth Street, N.W. Washington, DC 20001 tory.lauterbach@cwt.com

Anthony Pietranico
ConEdison Solutions Inc.
Electricity Supply Specialist
Tel: 732-741-5822 x204
pietranicoa@conedsolutions.com

Aundrea Williams
Director Regulatory Affairs
NextEra Power Marketing LLC
700 Universe Boulevard
Juno Beach, Fl. 33408
aundrea.williams@nexteraenergyservices.com

Ira G. Megdal Cozen O'Connor 457 Haddonfield Road Suite 300 P.O. Box 5459 Cherry Hill, NJ 08002 imegdal@cozen.com

Christi L. Nicolay
Division Director
Macquarie Energy LLC
500 Dallas St., Level 31
Houston, TX 77002
Christi Nicolay@macquarie.com

OTHER PARTIES

Sara Bluhm NJBIA 102 West State Street Trenton, NJ 08608-1199 sbluhm@njbia.org

John Holub NJ Retail Merchants Assoc. 332 West State Street Trenton, NJ 08618 John@njrma.org

Judy Misoyianis, Administrator New Jersey Retail Merchants Assoc. 332 West State Street Trenton, NJ 08618 judy.njrma@verizon.net Holly Minogue Gabel Associates Energy, Environmental, and Public Utility Consulting 417 Denison Street Highland Park, NJ 08904 holly.minogue@gabelassociates.com

Larry Spielvogel, PE L. G. Spielvogel, Inc. 190 Presidential Blvd # 310 Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004-1151 spielvogel@comcast.net

Robert Macksoud, Jr, CEP Director Energy Procurement EnergySolve One Executive Dr, Suite 401 Somerset, NJ 08873 macksoud@energysolve.com

Lyle Rawlings
Mid-Atlantic Solar Energy Industries
Association
Rutgers EcoComplex, Suite 208-B
1200 Florence-Columbus Road,
Bordentown, NJ 08505
lrawlings@mseia..net

Katie Bolcar Mid-Atlantic Director Solar Energy Industries Association 575 7th Street, NW, Suite 400, Washington DC 20005 kbolcar@seia.org

Bruce H. Burcat, Esq.
Executive Director
Mid-Atlantic Renewable Energy Coalition
208 Stonegate Way
Camden, DE 19934
bburcat@marec.us