B-36



STATE OF NEW JERSEY

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION
OF THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of Ian Finnell, Business Manager (C0272S), Essex County

CSC Docket No. 2015-959

Examination Appeal

ISSUED: NOV 2 0 2014 (RE)

Ian Finnell appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services (DSS) which found that he did not meet the experience requirements for the open competitive examination for Business Manager (C0272S), Essex County.

:

The subject examination announcement was issued with a closing date of May 16, 2014. The examination was open to residents of Essex County who met the announced requirements of a Bachelor's degree and two years of management experience which must have involved all of the following management functions:

1. setting program or organizational goals and objectives;

2. establishing organizational structure or determining the need for and developing plans for organizational changes:

3. setting policy for the organization or program managed by establishing program emphasis and priorities, and developing operating and procedural guidelines; and

4. directing the work of the organization or programs through subordinate levels of supervision.

Graduation from an accredited college or university with a Master's degree in Human Services Administration, Business Administration, Public Administration, Industrial Management, Industrial Engineering, Management Science, or in a program related to the organization, operation, administration, and control of private or public organizations could be substituted for one year of the indicated experience. The appellant was found to be below minimum requirements in experience. It is noted that four candidates have been admitted to the examination, which has not yet been held.

Mr. Finnell indicated on his application that he possessed a Bachelor's degree, and he listed seven positions on his application: 1) provisional Business Manager from February 2014 to the May 2014 closing date; 2) Benefits Consultant from October 2013 to February 2014; 3) Pension Consultant from August 2010 to October 2011; 4) Personal Banker from April 2010 to August 2010; 5) Financial Planner/Recruiter from February 2007 to July 2008; 6) licensed Financial Sales Representative from April 2005 to February 2007; and 7) Internal Wholesaler from October 1998 to April 2005. The appellant included a resume with three more positions, those of Broker, registered Financial Consultant, and Insurance Sales Agent. The appellant was credited with four months of experience in his provisional position. As such, the appellant was found to be lacking one year, eight months of qualifying management experience.

On appeal, Mr. Finnell states that for the past 28 years, he has worked in the business and financial industry in several capacities. He says that he was unfamiliar with the on-line application process, and failed to sufficiently describe the duties of his prior positions. He states that he has a Series 7 certification, held since 1992, which enables him to sell investment products and securities to individuals, brokers, banks, and advisors. He indicates that, as a licensed Financial Consultant, he specialized in developing business plans and management methods to improve clients' investment portfolios, and advised companies on profitable plans that would enable them to expand and improve their business. He states that, during his years as a personal banker, financial planner and financial consultant, his responsibilities included managing junior sales teams and banking assistants. He also maintains that he held a Life and Health Insurance license, which authorized him to use his expertise to develop strategies and recommend insurance products to those in need, as well as establish cost-effective policies that provided health benefits to its employees.

N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.3(b) provides that applicants shall meet all requirements specified in the open competitive examination announcement by the closing date.

CONCLUSION

A review of the appellant's application reveals that he does not meet the announced requirements. Qualified experience has the announced experience as the primary focus. Mr. Finnell's provisional position has applicable duties: however, his remaining positions, all within the insurance, financial and banking fields, do not.

For the second position, as a Benefits Consultant, the appellant counseled and enrolled group employees in benefit options, submitted weekly reports of appointment results and prospecting plans, completed online training in all concentrations (voluntary benefits, e.g. critical illness, disability, etc). As a Pension Consultant, the appellant analyzed pension accounts relative to retirement needs, ran analyses to uncover gaps in resources against living expenses, proposed allocation models and recommended rebalancing portfolios where needed, depending on risk tolerance and investment objectives. As a Personal Banker, the appellant managed branch accounts, consulted on all bank products to maximize bank relationships, ran monthly meetings with staff, held daily meetings to set strategy for contact with customers doing transactions, and reinforced the bank's mission of customer service, problem resolution, and deepening of the customer base. As a Financial Planner/Recruiter, the appellant analyzed tax clients' needs to see where wealth planning may fall short, performed regular reviews as appropriate, recruited investment advisors for tax practice acquisition, business development and succession planning for revenue stream. As a Financial Sales Representative, the appellant participated in monthly campaigns for the sale of all bank products, submitted weekly activity reports to the sales manager, teamed with an investment advisor to recommend investments to bank clients whose returns were nominal, and did so in a low interest rate environment. As an Internal Wholesaler, the appellant strategized daily with external wholesaler on marketing campaigns, set a regional schedule for meetings, ran reports for targeted prospecting to brokers, advisors, and financial institutions when new products rolled out, and deepened relationships with producers.

None of these positions involved the required management experience. He did not set organizational goals and objectives or policy, establish organizational structure and develop plans for organizational changes, develop operating and procedural guidelines, or direct the work of the organization. He did not supervise staff in any of his positions. His work as a Broker, registered Financial Consultant, and Insurance Sales Agent were also non-qualifying. In effect, the appellant was not accruing management experience including all required management functions while in these positions. The appellant was appropriately found to be lacking one year, eight months of required experience.

An independent review of all material presented indicates that the decision of DSS that the appellant did not meet the announced requirements for eligibility by the closing date is amply supported by the record. The appellant provides no basis to disturb this decision. Thus, the appellant has failed to support his burden of proof in this matter.

ORDER

Therefore, it is ordered that this appeal be denied.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON THE 19th DAY OF NOVEMBER, 2014

Robert M. Gech

Chairperson

Civil Service Commission

Inquiries and

Correspondence

Henry Maurer

Director

Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs

Civil Service Commission Written Record Appeals Unit

P. O. Box 312

Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

c:

Ian Finnell

Alan Abramowitz

Dan Hill