



STATE OF NEW JERSEY

In the Matter of Jonnel Cuff,
Personnel Aide (M0067E), Camden
City

**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION
OF THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION**

CSC Docket No. 2023-2794

Examination Appeal

ISSUED: November 22, 2023 (HS)

Jonnel Cuff appeals the determination of the Division of Agency Services (Agency Services), which found that, per the substitution clause for education, she did not meet the experience requirement for the open competitive examination for Personnel Aide (M0067E), Camden City.

The subject examination was announced with a closing date of January 23, 2023 and was open to Camden City and Camden County residents who possessed 60 semester hour credits from an accredited college or university. Applicants who did not possess the required education could substitute experience in technical aspects of personnel work on the basis of one year of experience for each 30 semester hour credits. The resulting eligible list of 15 names promulgated on June 15, 2023 and expires on June 14, 2026. Nine eligibles remain active.

On her application, the appellant did not indicate possession of the 60 semester hour credits. Therefore, pursuant to the substitution clause for education, she needed two years of applicable experience in total. The appellant listed her experience as "Clerk Typist"¹ from November 2004 to July 2014; Data Entry Operator 1 from July 2014 to June 2021; provisional Data Entry Operator 2 from June 2021 to October 2022; and provisional Personnel Aide from October 2022 to January 2023,² all with Camden City. Agency Services credited the appellant with four months of applicable experience based on her provisional service in the subject title. None of the remaining listed positions were credited. Specifically, Agency Services

¹ Per the County and Municipal Personnel System, the appellant's title was Keyboarding Clerk 1.

² The appellant was returned to her permanent title of Data Entry Operator 1 in September 2023.

noted that technical aspects of personnel work was not the primary focus of the appellant's "Clerk Typist" position, and there was no indication of such work in the Data Entry Operator positions. Therefore, Agency Services deemed the appellant ineligible since she lacked one year and eight months of experience and thus did not meet the experience requirement set forth in the announcement.

On appeal to the Civil Service Commission, the appellant maintains that she is eligible and describes the "increasing duties [she has] performed under supervision in Data Entry Operator 1 and Personnel Aide" in personnel work over the last 10 years.

CONCLUSION

N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.3(b)2 provides that applicants shall meet all requirements specified in the open competitive examination announcement by the closing date.

A review of the appellant's application reveals that she did not possess the required experience. In order for experience to be considered applicable, it must have as its primary focus full-time responsibilities in the areas required in the announcement. *See In the Matter of Bashkim Vlashi* (MSB, decided June 9, 2004). The amount of time, and the importance of the duty, determines if it is the primary focus. An experience requirement that lists a number of duties that define the primary experience, requires that the applicants demonstrate that they primarily performed all of those duties for the required length of time. Performance of only one or some of the duties listed is not indicative of comprehensive experience. *See In the Matter of Jeffrey Davis* (MSB, decided March 14, 2007). On appeal, the appellant maintains that she has performed "increasing duties" in the area of personnel work and references her Data Entry Operator and Personnel Aide experience. This argument does not establish the appellant's eligibility. The appellant already received full credit for the Personnel Aide position. As for the Data Entry Operator positions, considering both the original application and the appeal, the best that can be said of these positions is that they included *some* experience in technical aspects of personnel work but *primarily focused* on data entry. As such, those positions still cannot be credited. Accordingly, the record reflects that the appellant did not meet the requirements for the title under test.

ORDER

Therefore, it is ordered that this appeal be denied.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON
THE 22ND DAY OF NOVEMBER, 2023

Allison Chris Myers

Allison Chris Myers
Chairperson
Civil Service Commission

Inquiries
and
Correspondence

Nicholas F. Angiulo
Director
Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs
Civil Service Commission
Written Record Appeals Unit
P.O. Box 312
Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

c: Jonnel Cuff
Lisa Picon
Division of Agency Services
Records Center