



STATE OF NEW JERSEY

**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE
ACTION
OF THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION**

Vatsalkumar Patel, Administrative
Analyst 4, Information Systems
(PS9687T), Department of
Transportation

Examination Appeal

CSC Docket No. 2025-2677

ISSUED: September 2, 2026 (EG)

Vatsalkumar Patel appeals the determination of the Division of Agency Services (Agency Services) which found that he was below the minimum requirements in experience for the promotional examination for Administrative Analyst 4, Information Systems (PS9687T), Department of Transportation.

The subject promotional examination was announced with pertinent requirements which had to be met as of the announced closing date of January 21, 2025. The examination was open to employees in the competitive division who were currently serving in and had an aggregate of one year of continuous permanent service as of the closing date in the title of Administrative Analyst 3, Information Systems. It was also open to employees in the competitive division who had an aggregate of one year of continuous permanent service as of the closing date in any competitive title and met the requirements listed on the announcement. The announcement indicated the following requirements: eight years of professional experience in work involving the review, analysis, and evaluation of the administrative, business, and/or operational policies, procedures, practices, and processes and/or the technological requirements of an organization for the purpose of revising/enhancing existing information systems and/or developing/acquiring and implementing new IT solutions and services; OR Possession of a bachelor's degree from an accredited college or university; and four (4) years of the above-mentioned professional experience; OR possession of a master's degree in Public Administration,

Business Administration, Computer Science, Information Technology, Software Engineering, Information Security, Network Administration, or Database Management; and three (3) years of the above-mentioned professional experience. The Division of Agency Services (Agency Services) reviewed the appellant's application and found that he possessed a Bachelor's degree.¹ Agency Services credited him with one year and two months of applicable out-of-title work experience for his work as Principal Engineer Geotechnical listed on his application. Agency Services determined that none of the appellant's other work experience was applicable. Thus, he was found to be lacking two years and 10 months of needed experience.

On appeal, the appellant argues that since he joined the department he has been part of the Pavement Management Unit, which is responsible for pavement managing and drainage management systems. He states that these responsibilities involve data-driven decision-making and aligning with the qualifications for the subject examination. Additionally, he states that the Pavement Management System's task of identifying funding needs, formulating treatment programs, and forecasting system performance under various funding scenarios mirrors the Administrative Analyst's responsibility to evaluate system efficiency, recommend enhancements, and support the agency's business goals through effective IT solutions. The appellant adds that he is responsible for preparing reports and recommending IT policies to support the Pavement Management Group's need to supply actionable information for strategic planning. The appellant submits a summary of the duties he performed and indicates that this information was also in the resume he attached to his application. It is noted that the format used by the appellant in this summary and in the resume submitted with his application made it impossible to definitively attribute the duties performed to a specific job title he held. The summary within his application was clear. Further, the appellant indicates that his diverse experience in analyzing, developing, and optimizing procedures, along with his ability to lead projects and communicate effectively with stakeholders, aligns well with the responsibilities and requirements of the Administrative Analyst 4 Information Systems position.

CONCLUSION

N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.3(b) provides that applicants shall meet all requirements specified in the open-competitive examination announcement by the closing date. Additionally, *N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-6.3(b) provides that an appellant has the burden of proof in examination and selection disqualification appeals.

¹ The appellant's foreign evaluation service also indicates that he possesses the equivalent of a Master's degree in Civil Engineer – Structural Engineering and a Doctorate degree in Philosophy. However, the appellant did not receive additional credit for these degrees as they were not in the required areas.

In the instant matter, Agency Services appropriately denied the appellant's eligibility for the subject examination for lacking the required applicable experience. A review of the application and the duties performed by the appellant reveals that while in his position as Principal Engineer Geotechnical, he performed out-of-title duties that were applicable to the title under test. With regard to the other positions listed on his application, a review of the duties performed reveals that while there were some aspects of his job that were consistent with the experience requirements for the title under test, the primary focus of those positions was engineering and pavement data collection. It has been established that in order for experience to be considered applicable, it must have as its primary focus full-time responsibilities in the areas required in the announcement. *See In the Matter of Bashkim Vlashi* (MSB, decided June 9, 2004). The experience requirements for the Administrative Analyst 4, Information Systems examination were professional experience in work involving the review, analysis, and evaluation of the administrative, business, and/or operational policies, procedures, practices, and processes and/or the technological requirements of an organization for the purpose of revising/enhancing existing information systems and/or developing/acquiring and implementing new IT solutions and services. The duties listed by the appellant outside of his position as a Principal Engineer Geotechnical mostly consisted of collecting, maintaining, managing and extraction of the pavement data and traffic data. Thus, the primary focus of the duties he performed were not consistent with the experience requirement for the title under test. Accordingly, based on the foregoing, the appellant has not met his burden of proof, and has not provided a basis to disturb the determination of Agency Services that he was ineligible for the title under test.

ORDER

Therefore, it is ordered that the appeal be denied.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON
THE 2ND DAY OF SEPTEMBER, 2026



Mary Cruz
Acting Chairperson
Civil Service Commission

Inquiries
and
Correspondence

Shannon L. Dalton
Director
Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs
Civil Service Commission
Written Record Appeals Unit
P.O. Box 312
Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

c: Vatsalkumar Patel
Kelly Hutchinson
Division of Agency Services
Records Center