



STATE OF NEW JERSEY
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

Chris Christie
Governor
Kim Guadagno
Lt. Governor

Robert M. Czech
Chair/Chief Executive Officer

**MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING OF
THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
NOVEMBER 19, 2014**

**Robert M. Czech, Chairperson
Robert E. Brenner
Richard E. Williams**

NOVEMBER 19, 2014

A regular meeting of the Civil Service Commission was held on Wednesday, November 19, 2014, in Trenton, New Jersey.

PRESENT: Robert M. Czech, Chairperson, Members Robert E. Brenner and Richard E. Williams; Pamela Ullman, Deputy Attorney General; Henry Maurer, Director, Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs.

In accordance with L.1975, c.231, the Secretary to the Civil Service Commission opened the meeting with the following statement:

Notice of this meeting was filed with the Secretary of State and sent to the Trentonian, Trenton Times, Courier-Post and Star Ledger on December 2, 2013, and posted at the Civil Service Commission, 3 Station Plaza, Trenton, New Jersey.

All actions were by unanimous vote unless otherwise specified.

SECTION A – HEARING MATTERS

A-1 SETTLEMENT

In the Matter of Cynthia Thompson
North Jersey Developmental Center
Department of Human Services
Removal

**RECOMMENDATION OF THE ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE IN
THE ABOVE CASE – SETTLEMENT**

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission acknowledged the settlement.

**A-2 GREGORY BROOKS - CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-1319
OAL DOCKET NO. CSV: 17226-13**

Gregory Brooks, Police Officer, City of Newark, Police Department, 15 working day suspension on charges of insubordination, malingering and other sufficient cause.

Recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge - Modify the 15 working day suspension to a four working day suspension.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission affirmed the recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge, however, the Civil Service Commission did not adopt the Findings of Fact 15 through 18 of the Administrative Law Judge's decision.

**A-3 OBINNA I. ENWEREMADU, ET AL. - CSC DOCKET NO. 2012-3561
OAL DOCKET NO. CSV: 08941-12**

Obinna Enweremadu, Senior Accountant, County of Union, Department of Finances, layoff effective May 1, 2012.

Recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge – Uphold the layoff.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission affirmed the recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge and acknowledged the withdrawal of appeals filed by Susan Bertram-Kieri and Antonette Muscaritolo.

**A-4 ANN OSTERMAN- CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-510
OAL DOCKET NO. CSV: 14902-13**

Ann Osterman, Keyboarding Clerk 1, Middlesex County, Department of Medical Examiner, removal effective June 25, 2013, on charges of incompetency, inefficiency, or failure to perform duties, conduct unbecoming a public employee, other sufficient cause and an unauthorized absence.

Recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge – Uphold the removal.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission affirmed the recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge.

**A-5 BHADRESHKU PATEL - CSC DOCKET NO. 2010-1449
OAL DOCKET NO. CSV: 14102-09**

Bhadreshku Patel, Assistant Engineer Traffic, Department of Transportation, release at the end of the working test period effective October 20, 2009.

Recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge – Uphold the release at the end of the working test period.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission affirmed the recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge.

**A-6 KEISHA N. SINGLETARY - CSC DOCKET NO. 2013-3053
OAL DOCKET NO. CSV: 07364-13**

Keisha N. Singletary, Judiciary Clerk 3, Essex Vicinage, Judiciary, removal effective October 22, 2012, on charges of chronic or excessive absenteeism or lateness, other sufficient cause, unauthorized leave and job abandonment.

Recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge – Modify the removal to a resignation in good standing.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission affirmed the recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge.

SECTION B – MISCELLANEOUS MATTERS**B-1 MATTHEW DEBONIS – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-1254**

The City of Hackensack requests relaxation of the provisions of *N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-7.1A so as to permit the intergovernmental transfer of Matthew DeBonis from the title of Sheriff's Officer, Bergen County Sheriff's Department, to the title of Police Officer, City of Hackensack.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be granted.

B-2 MARIE SNYDER – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-812

The Department of the Treasury requests that the provisions of *N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-1.1(c) be relaxed in order to allow Marie Snyder to be provisionally appointed, pending promotional examination procedures, to the competitive title of Claims Investigator 2.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be granted.

B-3 JOSEPH CARUSO – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-829

The Division of Classification and Personnel Management, on behalf of the Department of Law and Public Safety, requests that Joseph Caruso be promoted from his current non-competitive title, Computer Operator Assistant, at the Department of the Treasury, Office of Information Technology, to the competitive title, Administrative Analyst 4, Fiscal Management, an un-related, above entry level title at the Department of Law and Public Safety.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be granted.

B-4 HELENE OSHER – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-828

The Division of Classification and Personnel Management, on behalf of the Department of Labor and Workforce Development, requests that Helene Osher be promoted from her current non-competitive title, Clerk, to the competitive title, Senior Audit Account Clerk, an un-related, above entry-level title.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this petition be granted.

B-5 RENEE MUHN-BENSEL – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-1053

The Department of the Treasury requests that the eligible list for Supervisor, Technical Services, Taxation (PS4013U), Department of the Treasury, be revived in order to appoint Renee Muhn-Bensel effective May 3, 2014.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be granted.

B-6 CHRISTINA BOSS – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-40

Christina Boss appeals the decision of the Division of Classification and Personnel Management that her position is properly classified as Fingerprint Processing Technician 2. The appellant seeks an Assistant Supervisor, Fingerprint Technical Unit job classification.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-7 FRANK FARANCA – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-2345

Frank Faranca appeals the decision of the Division of Classification and Personnel Management that the proper classification of his position with the Department of Environmental Protection is Administrative Analyst 1, Fiscal Management. The appellant seeks an Administrative Analyst 1 job classification.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied and the position be classified as an Environmental Specialist 4, pending promotional examination procedures, effective August 10, 2013.

B-8 PAN YUK HONG – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-2544

Pan Yuk Hong appeals the determination of the Division of Classification and Personnel Management that her position with the Department of the Treasury is properly classified as an Accountant 2. The appellant seeks an Accountant 1 job classification.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-9 SANDRA KNOX – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-41

Sandra Knox appeals the decision of the Division of Classification and Personnel Management that her position is properly classified as Fingerprint Processing Technician 2. The appellant seeks an Assistant Supervisor, Fingerprint Technical Unit job classification.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-10 PAUL MATERIA – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-42

Paul Materia appeals the decision of the Division of Classification and Personnel Management that his position is properly classified as Fingerprint Processing Technician 1. The appellant seeks a Fingerprint Processing Technician 2 job classification.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-11 IRENE WILLIAMS – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-43

Irene Williams appeals the decision of the Division of Classification and Personnel Management that her position is properly classified as Fingerprint Processing Technician 2. The appellant seeks an Assistant Supervisor, Fingerprint Technical Unit job classification.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-12 MICHAEL FALCARO – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-2387

Michael Falcaro appeals the decision of the Division of Classification and Personnel Management, which found that the appointing authority had presented a sufficient basis to remove his name from the special reemployment list for Cook, Sussex County on the basis of an unsatisfactory background report.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

VOTE: **Robert M. Czech** **(No)**
 Robert E. Brenner **(Yes)**
 Richard E. Williams **(Yes)**

B-13 JANET FRANCIS – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-523

Janet Francis, a former Human Services Specialist 1 with the Burlington County Board of Social Services, requests a hearing regarding her removal from employment effective December 5, 2012.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be denied.

B-14 JOSEPH GONZALEZ – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-2904

Joseph Gonzalez appeals the decision of the Division of Classification and Personnel Management, which found that the appointing authority had presented a sufficient basis to remove the appellant's name from the Correction Officer Recruit (S9988R) eligible list on the basis of falsification of his pre-employment application.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-15 DANIKA JOHNSON – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-2599

Danika Johnson appeals the removal of her name from the eligible list for Correction Officer Recruit (S9988R), Department of Corrections.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-16 RICHARD SAZON – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-1707

Richard Sazon, a former Graduate Nurse with Camden County Health Services Center, requests a hearing regarding his removal effective June 13, 2013.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this matter be referred to the Office of Administrative Law for a hearing.

**B-17 JOHN DENVIR AND PETER COUGHLIN –
CSC DOCKET NOS. 2015-996 AND 2015-997**

The Division of Classification and Personnel Management, on behalf of the Township of South Orange Village, requests that John Denvir be provided an appointment as Fire Captain, and that Peter Coughlin be provided a retroactive appointment as Deputy Fire Chief, effective December 1, 2013.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be granted.

B-18 M. F. – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-2085

M. F., a Human Services Assistant with the Woodbine Developmental Center, Department of Human Services, appeals the determination of the Director of Equal Employment Opportunity, stating that the appellant failed to present sufficient evidence to support a finding that she had been subjected to a violation of the New Jersey State Policy Prohibiting Discrimination in the Workplace.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

**B-19 RESEARCH ASSISTANT, CRIMINAL INFORMATION (C1033P),
MERCER COUNTY – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-2649**

Mercer County requests permission not to make an appointment from the October 16, 2013 certification for Research Assistant, Criminal Information (C1033P).

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission granted the appointment waiver and assessed selection costs in the amount of \$2,048.

B-20 JEREMY CANNON – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-1056

Jeremy Cannon appeals the decision of the Division of Selection Services which found that he was not employed in the announced title scope for the promotional examination for Fire Captain (PM1135S), Orange.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-21 TERESA COICO – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-2214

Teresa Coico appeals her score on the open competitive examination for Municipal Court Administrator (M0822R), Saddle Brook.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-22 WILLIAM EVERETT – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-466

William Everett, represented by Jeffrey Resnick, Esq., appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services that he did not meet the education requirement for the promotional examination for Environmental Specialist 4(PS6840G), Department of Environmental Protection.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

B-23 HARVEY LANE – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-819

Harvey Lane appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services which found that he did not meet the experience requirements for the open competitive examination for Keyboarding Clerk 2 (M0248S), Maurice River School District.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

B-24 MAGGIE MITCHELL – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-42

Maggie Mitchell appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services which found that she was below the minimum requirements in experience for the promotional examination for Superintendent Parks and Forestry 4 (PS6946G), Department of Environmental Protection.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-25 CHRISTOPHER NELSON – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-513

Christopher Nelson appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services that he was below the minimum requirements in experience for the open competitive examination for Senior Greenskeeper (M0329S), Berkeley.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

B-26 TIMOTHY RATTIGAN – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-494

Timothy Rattigan appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services which found that he did not meet the experience requirement for the promotional examination for Claims Examiner, Unemployment and Disability Insurance (PS8598N), Department of Labor and Workforce Development.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-27 ROBERT J. SANDERS – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-220

Robert J. Sanders appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services that he did not meet the experience requirement for the open competitive examination for Road Repairer 1 (C0175S), Atlantic County.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

B-28 DONNA SCHNEIDERMAN – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-1026

The Department of Law and Public Safety appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services which found that Donna Schneiderman was below the minimum requirements in experience for a prospective provisional appointment to the title of Technical Assistant 2, Purchasing.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

B-29 CHRISTOPHER CHIN – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-2361

The parties request that the Civil Service Commission acknowledge the settlement reached between the Cape May County Sheriff's Department and Christopher Chin, which provides for his separation from employment effective August 1, 2013 by way of disability retirement or resignation in good standing.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission acknowledged the settlement.

B-30 AMANDA KURDYLA – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-289

Amanda Kurdyla appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services denying her request for a make-up for Social Services Technician (C0015S), Passaic County.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

B-31 MICHAEL TOBIN – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-717

Michael Towbin appeals the decision of the Division of Selection Services denying his request for a make-up for the open-competitive examination for Administrative Analyst (M0864R), West New York.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

B-32 JUDITH PETRECCA – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-2269

Judith Petrecca appeals the determination of the Division of Classification and Personnel Management that her position with the Department of the Treasury is properly classified as a Principal Clerk typist. The appellant seeks a Technical Assistant 2, Treasury job classification.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-33 J. J. – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-111

J. J., a management-level employee with the Department of Transportation, appeals the decision of the Division of Civil Rights & Affirmative Action, which found that the appellant did commit a violation of the New Jersey State Policy Prohibiting Discrimination in the Workplace.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

B-34 JASMINE AMBERTHS – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-646

Jasmine Amberths appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services which found that she did not meet the requirements for the promotional examination for Senior Data Processing Programmer (PM0963R), Vineland.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

B-35 MAUREEN BORKOWSKI – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-541

Maureen Borkowski appeals the decision of the Division of Selection Services which found that she did not meet the experience requirements for the promotional examination for Senior Library Assistant (PC0446S), Ocean County.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-36 IAN FINNELL – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-959

Ian Finnell appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services which found that he did not meet the experience requirements for the open competitive examination for Business Manager (C0272S), Essex County.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-37 KATHLEEN WHITE – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-820

Kathleen White appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services which found that she did not meet the experience requirements for the open competitive examination for Site Manager Nutrition Program (C0318S), Morris County.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-38 CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MINUTES

Submitted for adoption are the Civil Service Commission minutes of its meeting of November 6, 2014.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission adopted the minutes of its meeting of November 6, 2014.

B-39 DONNA BROOKS - CSC DOCKET NO. 2013-2538

The appeal of Donna Brooks, a Clerk 3, Atlantic County, Department of Public Safety, of her 15 day suspension, on charges, was heard by Administrative Law Judge W. Todd Miller (ALJ), who rendered his initial decision on September 8, 2014. At its meeting on November 6, 2014, the Civil Service Commission did not adopt the ALJ's recommendation to modify the penalty to a 10 working day suspension. Rather, the Commission upheld the 15 working day suspension. The proposed final decision is now submitted for the Commission's review.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission adopted the final decision.

B-40 JOSE ROSADO - CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-56

The appeal of Jose Rosado, a Police Officer with the City of Newark, of his removal, effective November 14, 2011, on charges, was heard by Administrative Law Judge Michael Antoniewicz (ALJ), who rendered his initial decision on October 1, 2014. At its meeting on November 6, 2014, the Civil Service Commission did not adopt the ALJ's recommendation to reverse the removal. Rather, the Commission ordered that the matter be remanded to the Office of Administrative Law for further proceedings. The proposed decision is now submitted for the Commission's review.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission adopted the decision.

B-41 ELIZABETH BIBER-DESHIELDS – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-1526

Elizabeth Biber-Deshields appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services which found that she did not meet the experience requirements for the promotional examination for Supervising Community Program Specialist (PS0587K), Commission for the Blind and Visually Impaired.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

B-42 MATTHEW CALDERONE – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-782

Matthew Calderone appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services which found that he did not meet the minimum requirements in experience for the open competitive examination for the dual title Supervising Pumping Station Operator/Sewer Repairer Supervisor (M0440S), Union Township.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

B-43 STEPHANIE GRANT, ET AL. – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-70

Stephanie Grant and Jose Leon (PC2073R), Atlantic County; Chancey Skipper (PC2077R), Essex County; Anthony Corcione and William Ferring (PC2080R) Middlesex County; and Francis Antonowicz, Dana Gallo, Jonathan Gaul, Daniel Hudak, William Nagy, Raymond Paul, James Robertson, Julio Santiago, Jonathan Scotto Di Frega, David Smith and Michael Storcks (PC2081R), Monmouth County; appeal the promotional examination for County Correction Sergeant (various jurisdictions).

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that these appeals be denied.

VOTE: **Robert M. Czech** **(Abstained)**
 Robert E. Brenner **(Yes)**
 Richard E. Williams **(Yes)**

There being no further business before the Civil Service Commission, the meeting was adjourned to convene on Wednesday, December 3, 2014, at 10:00 a.m., at 3 Station Plaza, Trenton, New Jersey.

Robert M. Czech
Chairperson
Civil Service Commission