



New York City Department of  
**Environmental Protection**

*Impact Assessment of Natural Gas Production  
in the New York City Water Supply Watershed*

**Final Impact Assessment Report**

**December 22, 2009**

**HAZEN AND SAWYER**  
Environmental Engineers & Scientists



A joint venture

# Table of Contents

|  |      |
|--|------|
| Executive Summary .....  | ES-1 |
| Section 1: Introduction.....   | 1    |
| 1.1 Project Background.....  | 1    |
| 1.2 New York City Water System and Source Protection Measures.....       | 1    |
| 1.3 Trends in Drinking Water Regulations .....                           | 3    |
| 1.4 Overview of Natural Gas Well Development.....                        | 4    |
| 1.5 Regulatory Context for Gas Exploration and Development.....          | 6    |
| 1.6 Report Organization.....   | 8    |
| Section 2: Area Geology .....  | 9    |
| 2.1 Shale Gas Potential and the NYC Watershed .....                      | 9    |
| 2.2 Regional Geology .....   | 11   |
| 2.3 Water Resources and Hydrogeologic Conditions .....                   | 11   |
| 2.4 Faults and Other Brittle Structures .....                            | 13   |
| 2.5 NYC Water Supply Infrastructure Relative to Geological Features..... | 16   |
| 2.6 Summary .....  | 19   |
| Section 3: Rates and Densities of Natural Gas Well Development .....     | 21   |
| 3.1 Rates and Densities of Well Development in other Formations.....     | 21   |
| 3.2 Rate and Density of Well Development in the NYC Watershed.....       | 25   |
| 3.3 Summary .....  | 27   |
| Section 4: Cumulative Impacts .....                                      | 29   |
| 4.1 Quantification of Gas Well Development Activities .....              | 29   |
| 4.2 Land Disturbance, Site Activity, and Truck Traffic .....             | 32   |
| 4.3 Water Withdrawals .....  | 33   |
| 4.4 Chemical Usage .....   | 34   |
| 4.5 Surface Spills .....   | 36   |
| 4.6 Subsurface Migration.....  | 39   |
| 4.7 Wastewater Treatment and Disposal .....                              | 46   |
| Section 5: Summary .....   | 49   |
| Appendix A: Geologic and Hydrogeologic Setting .....                     | A-1  |
| Appendix B: Rates and Densities of Natural Gas Well Development.....     | B-1  |
| Appendix C: Surface Spill Contamination Analysis .....                   | C-1  |
| Appendix D: Potential Mitigation Measures .....                          | D-1  |

## List of Figures

|  |    |
|--|----|
| Figure ES-1: Potential Flow Disruption and Contamination Mechanisms.....   | 4  |
| Figure ES-2: Map of the East and West Delaware Tunnels and Neversink Tunnel.....   | 5  |
| Figure 1-1: Gas-Producing Shale Formations in the US .....   | 4  |
| Figure 2-1: Extent and Characteristics of Marcellus Formation in New York.....   | 10 |
| Figure 2-2: Bedrock Geology of the Catskill Region .....   | 12 |
| Figure 2-3: Cross-Section of Catskill Region Bedrock Geology.....  | 13 |
| Figure 2-4: Map of Geologic Faults and Linear Features in New York State.....  | 14 |
| Figure 2-5: Outcrops of the Hamilton Group (Plattekill Formation) near Ashokan Reservoir<br>Showing Persistence of Vertical Fractures across Lithologic Units..... | 15 |
| Figure 2-6: Example from West Delaware Tunnel Showing Correlation of Surface Linear<br>Features with Faults Observed During Construction.....                      | 17 |
| Figure 2-7: Map of the East and West Delaware Tunnels and Neversink Tunnel .....   | 18 |
| Figure 2-8: Geologic Cross Section of the West Delaware Tunnel.....  | 19 |
| Figure 3-1: Annual Well Completion Rates in Core Counties of Comparable Shale Gas Plays<br>(2001-2009).....  | 22 |
| Figure 3-2: Well Density in Comparable Shale Gas Plays (2001-2009).....  | 23 |
| Figure 3-3: Current Well Density in Core Counties of Comparable Shale Gas Plays (2009).....  | 23 |
| Figure 3-4: Marcellus Formation Gas Well Permitting and Completion in New York and<br>Pennsylvania Core Counties in 2007 (Top) and 2009 (Bottom).....              | 24 |
| Figure 3-5: NYC West-of-Hudson Watershed Land Ownership (April 2009).....  | 26 |
| Figure 3-6: Ownership Status of West-of-Hudson Watershed Land (April 2009).....  | 26 |
| Figure 4-1: Examples of potential flow regime disruption mechanisms .....  | 42 |

## List of Tables

|  |    |
|--|----|
| Table ES-1: Cumulative Water, Wastewater, and Chemical Volumes Associated with<br>Hydraulic Fracturing.....                              | 2  |
| Table 3-1: Areas of Major Shale Gas Plays Comparable to Marcellus formation in NYS .....   | 22 |
| Table 3-2: Annual Natural Gas Development Scenarios.....   | 25 |
| Table 4-1: Summary of Individual and Cumulative Impact Estimates.....  | 30 |
| Table 4-2: Impact of Refracturing on Cumulative Water, Wastewater, and Chemical<br>Volumes .....   | 31 |
| Table 4-3: Mass of Water, Sand and Major Classes of Fracturing Fluid Chemical Additives<br>Required for one 4 MG Fracture Operation..... | 35 |
| Table 4-4: Fracturing Chemical Spill Scenarios for Kensico Reservoir.....  | 38 |
| Table 4-5: Infiltration Rate to Tunnels that Would Cause Tunnel Discharge to Exceed<br>NYSDEC Part 703 Water Quality Limit .....         | 44 |