

## State of New Jersey

DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY DIVISION OF PURCHASE AND PROPERTY OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR 33 WEST STATE STREET P. O. BOX 039 TRENTON, NEW JERSEY 08625-0039 https://www.njstart.gov Telephone (609) 292-4886 / Facsimile (609) 984-2575

January 20, 2021

Via Electronic Mail Only jamisupholstery@aol.com

Susan Turkman Jamis Upholstery, LLC 3158 Route 88 Point Pleasant, NJ 08742

Re: I/M/O Bid Solicitation #19DPP00372 Jamis Upholstery, LLC Protest of Notice of Proposal Rejection T0969 Marine Craft and Related Products and Services

Dear Ms. Turkman:

This final agency decision is in response to your email of January 11, 2021, on behalf of Jamis Upholstery, LLC (Jamis) which was received by the Division of Purchase and Property's (Division) Hearing Unit. In that email, Jamis protests the Notice of Proposal Rejection issued by the Division's Proposal Review Unit for Bid Solicitation #19DPP00372 T0969 - Marine Craft and Related Products and Services (Bid Solicitation). The record of this procurement reveals that Jamis' Quote was rejected for failing to submit the *Ownership Disclosure Form* with its Quote.

By way of background, on October 30, 2020, the Division's Procurement Bureau (Bureau) issued the Bid Solicitation on behalf of New Jersey State Police, State Using Agencies and Cooperative Purchasing Program participates. Bid Solicitation §1.1 *Purpose and Intent*. The purpose of the Bid Solicitation was to solicit Quotes for marine craft and related products and services. *Ibid*. It is the State's intent to award Master Blanket Purchase Orders (Blanket P.O.s) to those responsible Vendors {Bidders} whose Quotes, conforming to this Bid Solicitation are most advantageous to the State, price and other factors considered. *Ibid*.

The record of this procurement reveals that on November 27, 2020, Jamis submitted Quote No. 00005040. On January 5, 2021, the Division's Proposal Review Unit opened twelve Quotes which were received by the submission deadline of 2:00 pm eastern time. After conducting a review of the Quotes received, the Division's Proposal Review Unit issued a Notice of Proposal Rejection to Jamis for failing to submit the *Ownership Disclosure Form* with its Quote. In response to the Notice of Proposal Rejection, on January 11, 2021, Jamis wrote to the Division's Hearing Unit stating in part:

I am protesting the rejection of my bid. All my quotes and related paperwork were filed including the ownership disclosure form.

PHILIP D. MURPHY Governor

SHEILA Y. OLIVER *Lt. Governor*  ELIZABETH MAHER MUOIO State Treasurer

> MAURICE A. GRIFFIN Acting Director

Submitting this quote was very difficult to accomplish, as the computer skills required are beyond my skill level. To be sure all the required paperwork was submitted, I emailed all of the forms to Rachel Bowen, who is in charge of this bid in case all of the attachments were not included with the quote.

Our small and family run business has had this contract with state of New Jersey for many years. We have worked very hard to satisfy the State's needs and to comply with all requirements.

The ownership disclosure form information has not changed.

In consideration of Jamis' protest, I have reviewed the record of this procurement, including the Bid Solicitation, Jamis' Quote and protest, the relevant statutes, regulations and case law. The review of the record has provided me with the information necessary to determine the facts of this matter and to render an informed final agency decision on the merits of the protest.

The Division's administrative regulations that govern the advertised procurement process establish certain requirements that must be met in order for a Quote to be accepted. Those regulations provide in relevant part that:

(a) In order to be eligible for consideration for award of contract, the bidder's proposal <u>shall<sup>1</sup></u> conform to the following requirements or be subject to designation as a non-responsive proposal for non-compliance:

4. <u>Contain all RFP-required certifications</u>, forms, and attachments, <u>completed and signed as required</u>. An RFP may designate certain forms and/or certifications that need not be included in the bidder's proposal but that must be provided by a successful bidder upon request prior to an award of contract;

[N.J.A.C. 17:12-2.2(a), emphasis added.]

If the requirements of N.J.A.C. 17:12-2.2 are not met, a Quote must be rejected. This regulation mandates stringent enforcement to maintain the equal footing of all Vendors {Bidders} and to ensure the integrity of the State's bidding process.

The subject procurement was comprised of the Bid Solicitation, other documents and mandatory forms which were specifically addressed in Bid Solicitation Section 4.0 *Quote Preparation and Submission* which states in pertinent part:

Vendor's {Bidder's} failure to complete, sign and submit the forms in Section 4.4.1.2 shall be cause to reject its Quote as non-responsive.

[Bid Solicitation § 4.4.1.2 NJ Standard Bid Solicitation Forms Required With The Quote.]

Among those forms required to be submitted with the Quote is the *Ownership Disclosure Form*. With respect to ownership, the New Jersey Legislature, in implementing N.J.S.A. 52:25-24.2, mandated

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> "Shall - Denotes that which is a mandatory requirement." Bid Solicitation Section 2.2 General Definitions.

that a Vendor {Bidder} must supply its ownership information, prior to or with its Quote, to be eligible to enter into a Blanket P.O. with the State. N.J.SA. 52:25-24.2 states, in pertinent part:

No corporations, partnership, or limited liability company shall be awarded any [Blanket P.O] nor shall any agreement be entered into for the performance of any work or the furnishing of any materials or supplies, the cost of which is to be paid with or out of any public funds, by the State, or any county, municipality or school district, or any subsidiary agency of the State, or of any county, municipality or school district, or by any authority, board, or commission which exercises governmental functions, unless prior to the receipt of the bid or accompanying the bid, of said corporation, said partnership, or said limited liability company there is submitted a statement setting for the names and addresses of all stockholders in the corporation who own 10 percent or more of its stock, of any class, or of all individual partners in the partnership who own a 10 percent or greater interest therein, or of all members in the limited liability company who own a 10 percent or greater interest therein as the case may be, shall also be listed. The disclosure shall be continued until names and addresses of every noncorporate stockholder, and individual partner, and member exceeding the 10 percent ownership criteria established in this act, has been listed.

The *Ownership Disclosure Form* is specifically discussed in Bid Solicitation Section § 4.4.1.2.1 which states in part:

Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 52:25-24.2, in the event the Vendor {Bidder} is a corporation, partnership or limited liability company, the Vendor {Bidder} must complete an Ownership Disclosure Form.

A current completed Ownership Disclosure Form must be received prior to or accompany the submitted Quote. A Vendor's {Bidder's} failure to submit the completed and signed form with its Quote will result in the rejection of the Quote as non-responsive and preclude the award of a Blanket P.O. to said Vendor {Bidder} unless the Division has on file a signed and accurate Ownership Disclosure Form dated and received no more than six (6) months prior to the Quote submission deadline for this procurement. If any ownership change has occurred within the last six (6) months, a new Ownership Disclosure Form must be completed, signed and submitted with the Quote.

In the alternative, to comply with this section, a Vendor {Bidder} with any direct or indirect parent entity which is publicly traded may submit the name and address of each publicly traded entity and the name and address of each person that holds a 10 percent or greater beneficial interest in the publicly traded entity as of the last annual filing with the federal Securities and Exchange Commission or the foreign equivalent, and, if there is any person that holds a 10 percent or greater beneficial interest, also shall submit links to the websites containing the last annual filings with the federal Securities and Exchange Commission or the foreign equivalent and the relevant page numbers of the filings that contain the information on

each person that holds a 10 percent or greater beneficial interest. <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 52:25-24.2.

Vendors {Bidders} using *NJSTART* to submit a Quote shall make the appropriate certification on the "Maintain Terms and Categories" Tab within its profile by checking the applicable box and, if required, completing and attaching the shortened Ownership Disclosure Form. Vendors {Bidders} not using *NJSTART* to submit a Quote must complete the full Ownership Disclosure Form located on the Division's website.

In order to make this process of certifying easier, the Division provides to the bidding community the *Ownership Disclosure Form* to be completed by Vendors {Bidders} to comply with the statutory requirements. As an alternative to the submission of the *Ownership Disclosure Form*, as noted in Bid Solicitation Section 4.4.1.2.1 above, Vendors {Bidders} using *NJSTART* to submit a Quote are required to make the appropriate certification regarding ownership disclosure on the "Maintain Terms and Categories" Tab within its profile. With respect to ownership, Vendors {Bidders} are able to select one of the following descriptors:

## **Category: Ownership Disclosure**

Description: N.J.S.A. 52:25-24.2 requires disclosure of the names and addresses of those individuals, partnerships and/or corporations owning a 10% or greater interest in the bidding entity ("interest owners"). Further, if any of these interest owners is itself a partnership or corporation, you must disclose the names and addresses of the interest owners of that partnership or corporation.

Please select at most one category value

Select

- The bidder is a non-profit entity and is exempt from the ownership disclosure requirement. See Disclosure of Non-Profit Officers and Directors below. (No Ownership Disclosure form is required.)
- There are no individuals, partnerships or corporations with a 10% or greater interest in the bidding entity, therefore the bidder is exempt from the ownership disclosure requirement. (No Ownership Disclosure form is required.)

Neither statement is applicable. A current, true and complete Statement of Bidder Ownership on the attached form has been or will be uploaded to the vendor profile prior to the submission deadline and is intended to accompany the bidder's submission.

Jamis did respond to the Ownership Disclosure category as required.

## Category: Ownership Disclosure

Description: N.J.S.A. 52:25-24.2 requires disclosure of the names and addresses of those individuals, partnerships and/or corporations owning a 10% or greater interest in the bidding entity ("interest owners"). Further, if any of these interest owners is itself a partnership or corporation, you must disclose the names and addresses of the interest owners of that partnership or corporation.

Neither statement is applicable. A current, true and complete Statement of Bidder Ownership on the attached form has been or will be uploaded to the vendor profile prior to the submission deadline and is intended to accompany the bidder's submission.

However, Jamis' response required that Jamis submit the *Ownership Disclosure Form* with its Quote or upload a completed *Ownership Disclosure Form* to its *NJSTART* Vendor profile. Jamis did not upload the *Ownership Disclosure Form* with the Quote.

Quote 00005040 - Jamis Upholstery LLC										
General	ltems	Questions	Subcontractors	Terms & Conditions	Attachments	Evaluations	Preference	Reminders	Summary	
Files										
				No File Att	achments					
Forms										
				No Form At	tachments					
				Close V	Vindow					
				© 2020 Periscope Hol SONJ SONJ AWS PRO		0	i.			

Nor did Jamis upload the Ownership Disclosure Form to its NJSTART Vendor profile.

ndor Profile -	Jamis I	Uphols	stery LLC							
Organization information	Users	Address	Commodity Codes and Services	Regions	Terms & Categorles	Attachments	Vendor Performance			
Attachments In	ormati	on								
No Attachments found for this vendor.										
Forms										
			No Form Attac	hments						
			Close Win	dow						
		Co	pyright © 2020 Periscope Holdin	igs, Inc A	ll Rights Reserved.					

In reviewing a Quote submitted in response to a Bid Solicitation, the Division does not have the power to waive the legislative requirement that a Vendor {Bidder} provide its ownership information prior to or accompanying the Quote submission. Only the New Jersey Legislature can change a requirement it has mandated. Unfortunately, Jamis did not comply with any of the options available to it for the submission of ownership information. Notwithstanding Jamis' interest in competing for this procurement, to allow Jamis to submit the *Ownership Disclosure Form* after bid opening would violate the Legislative requirement outlined in N.J.S.A. 52:25-24.2, a requirement that this Division is not authorized to waive.

If the requirements of N.J.A.C. 17:12-2.2 are not met, a Quote must be rejected. The Division's governing regulations mandate stringent enforcement to maintain the equal footing of all Vendors {Bidders} and to ensure the integrity of the State's bidding process. The *NJSTART* system does not prevent a Vendor {Bidder} from submitting a Quote without all of the required forms and documents attached as mandated by the specifications. The responsibility for ensuring that all necessary forms and other submittals, are uploaded into *NJSTART* necessarily and appropriately rests solely with the Vendor {Bidder}. Bid Solicitation § 1.4.2 *Vendor {Bidder} Responsibility*. Here, unfortunately, Jamis submitted

a Quote without a completed *Ownership Disclosure Form* attached. In fact, as show in the screenshot above, Jamis' Quote was submitted without any documents attached.<sup>2</sup>

This is an unfortunate situation for the State as the Division encourages competition and appreciates the time and effort put forth in preparing and submitting the Quote. In light of the findings set forth above, I sustain the Proposal Review Unit's Notice of Proposal Rejection.

Thank you for your company's continuing interest in doing business with the State of New Jersey and for registering your business with *NJSTART* at <u>www.njstart.gov</u>. I encourage you to log into *NJSTART* to select any and all commodity codes for procurements you may be interested in submitting a Quote for so that you may receive notification of future bidding opportunities. This is my final agency decision on this matter.

Sincerely,

Rachel Doobrajh Rachel Doobrajh

Rachel Doobrajh Acting Chief Hearing Officer

c. J. Kerchner K. Thomas C. Murphy R. Bowen A. Nelson D. Rodriguez

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Should Jamis have questions regarding the Quotes created, it may visit the *NJSTART Vendor Support Page* and review the Division's Quick Reference Guide entitled "How to Review a Submitted Quote," located at <u>https://www.state.nj.us/treasury/purchase/njstart/pdf/HowtoReviewaSubmittedQuote.pdf</u>, which provides information and instructions on how to review created and/or submitted Quotes.